

Report of Ex-post Evaluation

Project PD 389/05 Rev. 2 (F)

**Application of the Internal Monitoring of SFM Performance
Guidelines at forest management unit level in Indonesia**

Prepared by

Don Wijewardana & B C Y Freezailah

44RFM-2c
29 October 2010

Table of Contents

Acronyms and Abbreviations	3
Executive summary	4
1 Introduction	6
2 Evaluation scope, focus and approach	7
3. Project Facts	8
4 Findings, Lessons Learned	9
5 Conclusions and recommendations	18
5.1 Conclusions	18
5.2 Recommendations	19
6. Acknowledgements	20
7. Annexes	21

Acronyms and Abbreviations

APHI	Association of Forest Concession Holders
C&I	Criteria and Indicators
EU	European Union
FLEGT	Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and Trade
FMU	Forest Management Unit
IMPG	Internal Monitoring Performance Guidelines
INGOs	International Non-government Organisations
ITTA	International Tropical Timber Agreement
ITTC	International Tropical Timber Council
ITTO	International Tropical Timber Organization
IUPHHK	Forest Plantation Wood Production Permit
IUPJL	Permit to Manage Environmental Services
MoF	Ministry of Forestry
NGO	Non-government Organization
PD	Project Document
PFE	Permanent Forest Estate
REDD	Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation
SFM	Sustainable Forest Management

Executive summary

This ex-post evaluation relates to Project PD 389/05 Rev.2 (F): Application of the internal monitoring of SFM performance at forest management unit level in Indonesia. The project had a budget of US\$ 608,738, of which the ITTO contributed US\$ 381,888 and the Government of Indonesia US\$ 226,850. It had a two-year implementation period commencing on 2 January 2007 and completed on 30 April 2009 following a four-month extension.

The project was aimed to address the findings of a previous project, PD 42/00 Rev.1 (F), that the absence of a performance monitoring system (IMPG) within forest management unit in Indonesia was one of the causes of slow progress in sustainable forest management practices. The strategy to achieve that aim included training of government officers and forest managers throughout the country. The project was a collaborative effort between the Ministry of Forestry (MoF), The Association of Indonesian Forest Concessionaires (APHI) and International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO).

The development objective of the project was to accelerate the implementation sustainable forest management practices carried out by forest management units as members of the APHI.

There were two specific objectives: (1) To improve the capability of human resources on the application of Performance Monitoring System and (2) To promote the government policy on regulating the application of Internal Monitoring Performance Guidelines (IMPG) as a compulsory task among forest management units.

The output from specific objective 1 were formulation of training design and training Forest Management Unit's and Government Officers in the use of IMPG. Expected outputs from specific objectives 2 were the dissemination and implementation of IMPG and formulation of government policy on IMPG.

This exp-post evaluation is based on the terms of reference of the consultants, which included an assessment of the role and contribution of the forest to SFM in the Philippines taking into account specific studies and research undertaken as part of the project as well as its impact and effectiveness including relative success or failure.

The project has been well managed and commitments delivered within budget. The consultants examined the steering committee minutes and audit reports of the project and found it had been completed within the financial and other parameters.

The two outputs relating to Objective 1 had been successfully achieved with the development of appropriate training material and the number of the trained exceeding the target 200. The amalgamation of C&I for sustainable management with timber legality verification in the training has been a useful move since they complemented each other and helped reduce cost of undertaking separate training courses.

The performance relating to Objective 2 was mixed. The distribution of IMPG documents to FMUs had been done through those who participated in the training workshops and the workshop set up specifically for this purpose. Since less than half the FMUs were involved in the training the impact of the report was limited. However, IMPG documents had also been made available through the Ministry of Forestry website.

Also, there was no evidence that "the number of FMUs which had defined effective strategy for SFM improvement increase by 20 per cent". With regard to formulating government policy on IMPG, a part

of this output had been achieved with the workshop held on government policy but no other action had been taken on this score. However, it seems to have been addressed since completion of the project with the issuing of Ministerial Decree 38/2009 consolidating Standards and Guidelines on Assessment of Performance In Sustainable Production Forest Management And Timber Legality Verification. Another expectation on the completion of the project was that 'the system database has been implemented and designed to accommodate the report from forest management units'. This too had not been achieved as planned. But progress was being made as evident from the training that was still going on when the consultant visited the country in July 2010 for the ex-post evaluation. Since then a database has been designed and promoted to accommodate the reporting from forest management units and data input and monitoring have been carried out by the Ministry of Forestry. The database had also been improved and the documents made available widely through the Ministry of Forestry Website.

The project has been of considerable significance to Indonesia not only for providing appropriate tools to implement SFM at the national and the FMU levels but also for playing a catalytic role in generating enthusiasm within the forest industry, and keen interest from the government to use it to ensure legality and sustainability of the forest resource. The move has also received the endorsement of the international donors and NGOs, who had come forward to provide support.

It has also produced a number of important studies including the training modules painstakingly prepared incorporating ITTO C&I, domestic circumstances and requirements for timber legality verification; Report on Training on the application of IMPG; Evaluation of training impacts on sustainable management of FMUs) and the Final Report Analyzing Government Policies to Support Sustainable Forest Management (February 2009). But the most important document emerged following the completion of the project but based on its successful outcome. That was the Regulation P.38/Menhut-II/2009, issued by the Minister of Forestry, which brought together in one place updated regulations on standards and guidelines.

However, it does not appear that the forest dependent community has played any significant role in the planning and implementation of the project. It has been estimated that 50-60 million people, almost a quarter of the population, live in land classified as forest zone. Unless properly channeled, their actions could work counter to the efforts towards SFM. The other related group, which does not seem to have played a major role in the project, is the NGOs. The greater involvement of these two groups would have added not only to the integrity of the project but also would have provided support for implementation of C&I.

The reason for not involving the forest dependent community in the planning has been that the project was designed to improve the capacity of the forest management unit staff to implement internal monitoring and as such there was no reason to involve them. In the implementation phase, the executing agency assured, they were consulted. Similarly, NGOs too had been involved at the beginning in the first workshop. However, given the fact that with the forest community having a pervasive impact on sustainability there involvement especially in the planning stage would have been extremely beneficial in terms of the expected outcomes.

Among the lessons learned are the reasons for success of this initiative compared with earlier efforts to implement SFM. The main success factors are:

- a) Incorporation of incentives for implementing C&I,
- b) Use of independent auditors to assess performance,
- c) Commitment of the APHI.

These elements have helped to add greater credibility to the new C&I package, which has attracted interest of the industry, as well as donor countries and INGOs.

But for the continued success of the project a number of issues needed to be addressed. Among

them are a clearly defined permanent forest estate, greatly reduced interference in the management of FMUs by the central and regional governments and facilitation of training for all FMUs. Action is also needed to ensure the dedication of managers of FMUs to the new measures. The training of technical people alone may not result in FMUs applying the tools unless the top management is committed to its aims. It is critically important that their assurance is gained prior to launching projects of this nature.

1 Introduction

1.1 Purpose of evaluation

ITTO is an intergovernmental organization established in 1986 to administer the provisions and operation of the International Tropical Timber Agreement (ITTA), particularly in the promotion of international trade in tropical timber, the sustainable management of tropical forests and the development of tropical forest industries through international cooperation, policy work and project activities.

In pursuit of its objectives the Committee on Reforestation and Forest Management, at its Forty-third Session, decided to conduct the ex-post evaluation of the following projects relating to Criteria and Indicators of Sustainable Forest Management:

1. PD 225/03 Rev.1 (F) Adoption and implementation of an appropriate system of criteria and indicators for the Philippines.
2. PD 195/03 Rev.2 (F) To establish a national monitoring information system for the effective conservation and sustainable management of Thailand's forest resources.
3. PD 389/05 Rev.2 (F) Application of the internal monitoring of SFM performance at forest management unit level (Indonesia).

The primary purpose of the evaluation is to provide a concise diagnosis of the three projects related to criteria and indicators of sustainable forest management so as to point out the successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for successes and failures, and the contribution of the projects towards ITTO's Objective 2000 and the ITTO Yokohama Action Plan, and to draw lessons that can be used to improve similar projects in the future.

1.2 Project Details

This ex-post evaluation relates to Project 3. PD 389/05 Rev.2 (F): Application of the internal monitoring of SFM performance at forest management unit level (Indonesia).

With an estimated 88 million hectares under forest, accounting for 48 per cent of land area, Indonesia is one of the highly forested countries in Asia. But with heavy exploitation during the latter part of the last century, and plagued by problems such as shifting cultivation, unauthorised occupation, illegal logging and government acquisitions for other uses the country is facing a difficult task to stem the continuing deforestation and forest degradation. Several measures taken, such as a logging ban have not been able to reverse the decline. In more recent times the government has adopted sustainable management as the main tool to address the problems. For this purpose Indonesia has adopted the ITTO criteria and indicators. The project PD 389/05 Rev. 2 (F) was an initiative to implement the C&I.

The project had a budget of US\$ 608,738, of which the ITTO had contributed US\$ 381,888 and the Government of Indonesia US\$ 226,850. It had a two-year implementation period commencing on 2 January 2007 but was completed on 30 April 2009 following a four-month extension.

This project complies with the following objectives of the International Tropical Timber Agreement of 1994:

- a. To contribute to the process of sustainable development.
- b. To enhance the capacity of members to implement a strategy for achieving objective 2000.
- c. To promote the expansion and diversification of internal trade in tropical timber from

- sustainable sources
- d. To promote increased and further processing of tropical timber from sustainable sources
 - e. To improve marketing and distribution of tropical timber exports from sustainable managed sources.

The project also complies with ITTO Yokohama Action Plan 2002-2006 in the field of Reforestation and Forest Management with particular references to Goal 1, and Goal 2:

- Goal 1. : Support activities to secure the tropical timber resources base,
Goal 2. : Promote sustainable management of tropical forest resources.

2. Evaluation scope, focus and approach

The ex-post evaluation is based on the terms of reference of the consultants, which included the following:

1. The overall role and contribution of the project in light of sectoral policies, development programmes, priorities and requirements to improve the criteria and indicators of sustainable forest management (SFM) in the countries concerned.
2. The current status of criteria and indicators (C&I) of SFM in the concerned countries, the effectiveness of the project's implementation and its effectiveness in promoting SFM.
3. The contributions of the specific studies in various C&I-related tools/manuals/guidelines prepared by the project as regards the monitoring of sustainable forest management in the concerned countries.
4. The results and potential impact of applied research conducted by the project (if any) and its contribution to the overall knowledge on criteria and indicators of sustainable forest management in the country.
5. The impact of project activities on the improvements of forest management monitoring.
6. The effectiveness of dissemination of project results.
7. The overall post-project situation in the concerned country.
8. The unexpected effects and impacts, either harmful or beneficial, and the reasons for their occurrences.
9. The cost efficiency in the implementation of the project, including the technical, financial and managerial aspects.
10. Follow-up actions in order to enhance uptake of project results.
11. The project's relative success or failure, including a summary of the key lessons learnt; and the identification of any issues or problems that should be taken into account in designing and implementing similar projects in the future.

A team comprising Don Wijewardana from New Zealand and Dr B.C.Y. Freezailah from Malaysia undertook the evaluation. As part of the assessment Don Wijewardana visited Indonesia from 4 – 16 July 2010. Based on earlier communications with the ITTO Secretariat and the Indonesian Ministry of Forestry (the Implementing Agency of the project), a programme of meetings with relevant officials and agencies, which included a field visit, was developed for the visit. Details of the programme and parties met are shown in Annex II. As indicated there, meetings were held with government officials, forest industry and some of the other stakeholders.

The following reports and documents relating to the project were made available to the consultants:

- a. Progress Reports No. 1 – 4
- b. Technical Reports
 - i. Technical Report Reviewing The Existing Monitoring System and Improving Internal Monitoring Performance Guidelines at Forest Management Unit Level
 - ii. Technical Report on Design Training Curriculum, Modules, Materials and Participant's Criteria
 - iii. Technical Report of Documents Internal Monitoring Performance Guidelines

- c. Training Reports
 - i. Training on Application of The Internal Monitoring System of SFM Performance for Natural Production Forest
 - ii. Training on Coordination of the Application of the Internal Monitoring of SFM Performance at Forest Management Unit Level
- d. Proceeding of Workshops
 - i. Socialization on the Internal Monitoring of SFM Performance
 - ii. Socialization on Result of Analysing Government Policies To Support Sustainable Forest Management
- e. Other
 - i. Project document
 - ii. Project completion report
 - iii. Audit reports

3 Project facts

The project was based on findings in the previous project PD 42/00 Rev.1 (F), which had concluded that the absence of a performance monitoring system within forest management unit in Indonesia was one of the causes of slow progress on sustainable forest management practices. During the period 1997 – 2003 there was a decline in the number of FMU for Natural Tropical Forest from 400 to about 267 FMU. This had led to the decline in the quality and quantity of tropical forest ecosystem in the country. Out of 267 FMUs, only five had received SFM certification. From these, project PD 42/00 concluded that forest management units should adopt an internal management performance monitoring system developed by it. This system was also expected to enhance the effectiveness of government control over forest management units.

The current project was a collaborative effort between the Ministry of Forestry (MoF), The Association of Indonesian Forest Concessionaires (APHI) and International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO). The project implementation period was two year from January 2007 but eventually extended by four months with no extra budgetary outlay. Directorate General for Forestry Production Development was the Executing Agency.

3.1 Objectives, Outputs and Activities

The development objective of the project was to accelerate the implementation sustainable forest management practices carried out by forest management units as members of the APHI.

There were two specific objectives: (1) To improve the capability of human resources on the application of Performance Monitoring System initiated in the previous project PD 42/00 Rev. 1 (F); (2) To promote the government policy on regulating the application of Internal Monitoring Performance Guidelines (IMPG) as a compulsory task among forest management units.

The outputs from specific objectives 1 were (1.1.) Training design formulated and; (1.2.) Forest Management Unit's and Government Officers are trained on the use of IMPG. And from the specific objectives 2 were (2.1.) The Internal Monitoring Management Performance Guidelines (IMPG) is disseminated and implemented and (2.2) Government policy on IMPG is formulated.

The project aimed to improve the capability of human resources through the implementation of Performance Monitoring System in their forest management unit. The strategy to achieve that aim include training of government officers and forest managers all over Indonesia.

The number of participants in the training was 226 which included 205 from FMUs, 18 from government and three consultants. An ex-post evaluation was held afterwards to assess the effectiveness of the training. Based on its findings, the project conducted additional training workshops for additional 51 persons taking the total number trained well above the planned total, to 277.

There were a number of activities related to the outputs for each objective. They are detailed in the Project Document. In summary they included the following. Specific Objectives 1: To improve the capability of human resources on the application of Performance Monitoring System. Outputs related to this were formulating training design and training FMU and Government Officers in the use of IMPG. Specific Objectives 2: To promote the government policy on IMPG as a compulsory task among forest management units. Output relating to that were Disseminating IMPG and developing government policy on it. There was a wide range of activities to help achieve the two aims, altogether 13 of them.

Output 1.1. Training design formulated

- 1: Reviewing the existing monitoring system and improving IMPG (formulated during project PD 42/00 Rev. 1)
- 2: Design training curriculum, training modules, include materials needed and participant criteria
- 3: Conducting expert discussion to evaluate the established training curriculum, modules, training materials and participant
- 4: Formulating TOR for training instructors and discussion on selecting training instructors
- 5: Formulating and producing of training materials

Output 1.2. Forest Management Units' and Government Officers are trained on the use of IMPG

1. Survey and feasibility assessing of training site in the region
2. Recruitment of participants
3. Conducting training activities for about 7 (seven) days in each establishment training site

Output 2.1. The Internal Monitoring Management Performance Guidelines (IMPG) is disseminated and implemented

- 1: Conducting workshop to disseminate the IMPG among related parties
- 2: Conducting a joint team (APHI-MoF) on the evaluation of the training impacts on the progress of the SFM made by forest concession holders

Output 2.2. Government policy on IMPG is formulated

1. Analysing the government policies which are suitable with nowadays and future demands
2. Workshop on formulated government policy

Output 3.1. Report

1. Progress Report and Completion Report

As can be seen the project was complex involving a number of outputs and activities.

4 Findings, lessons learned

4.1 Achievements, realized versus planned

The development objective of the project was to accelerate the implementation of sustainable forest management practices of the FMUs and the two specific objectives included:

- i.) Improving the capability of human resources on the application of Performance Monitoring System initiated in the previous project PD 42/00 Rev. 1 (F), and
- ii) to promote the government policy on regulating the application of Internal Monitoring Performance Guidelines (IMPG) as a compulsory task among forest management units.

Each specific objective also had two outputs. The two outputs relating to Objective 1 had been successfully achieved with the development of appropriate training material and the number of the trained exceeding the target 200. The amalgamation of C&I for sustainable management with timber legality verification in the training has been a useful move since they complemented each other and helped reduce cost of undertaking separate training courses.

With regard to the outputs relating to Objective 2, the distribution of IMPG documents to FMUs, had not been completed at the end of the project as undertaken in the project document. However, this is not a cause for major concern since the documentation had been given to all trainees and had also been posted on the MoF website. Also in relation to specific objective 2 although there was interest from the industry in applying the new criteria, there was no evidence that “the number of FMUs which had defined effective strategy for SFM improvement increase by 20 per cent”. This is a difficult indicator to measure quantitatively.

In relation to output 2.2 -“Government Policy on IMPG formulated”, a part of this output had been achieved with the workshop held on government policy, which made a number of recommendations. But this was one step short of formulating government policy. At the time of project completion no other action had been taken on this score. However, the issue since completion of the project, of Ministerial decree 38/2009 consolidating Standards and Guidelines on Assessment of Performance In Sustainable Production Forest Management And Timber Legality Verification covering all types of forests was a landmark development in formulating government policy.

The expectation on the completion of the project was that ‘the system database has been implemented and designed to accommodate the report from forest management units’. However, this had not been achieved as planned. However, progress was being made as evident from the training that was still going on to implement this when the consultant visited the country in 2010 for the ex post evaluation.

4.2 Project Sustainability

There are a number of factors that suggest the project results are sustainable. At the same time, there are many that weigh against their sustainability. The reasons that tend to promote sustainability of the project results include:

- Government commitment to SFM based on C&I as evident from the ‘market oriented’ approach it has taken to persuade the industry to implement criteria and indicators.
- Offer of a major incentive by MoF (through Decrees 6/07 and 3/08) by allowing self-assessment of annual logging plan for those FMUs who successfully applied IMPG system.
- The comprehensive presentation of the government policy on SFM through Ministerial Decree 38/2009 with a ‘carrot and stick’ approach.
- Interest of the forest industry in implementing SFM as evident from its interest to continue the training on its own even after the project had wound down;
- New emerging market requirements such as the EU Due Diligence Regulations and the US Lacey Act which require legally verified timber will boost the application of IMPG. European Union is already negotiating the FLEGT-VPA Voluntary Partnership Agreement.
- Recognition of the need for continuing the training process by the international community as evident from the support from Nature Conservancy to APHI to continue training. Although the contribution was modest its significance was far greater considered along side similar support for capacity building by WWF.

However, there are also several factors that militate against sustainability of the outcomes of the project:

- Not all FMUs show the same commitment to sustainable management. An ex-post evaluation undertaken by the project team since completion of the training in IMPG found that only 36 per cent of the FMUs, which had trained staff, showed signs of improvement.
- Of the 323 FMUs involved in forest management, so far, only just over 120 had sent staff for training in IMPG. Trainees themselves had identified lack of commitment from managers as a major potential problem for adopting the system.
- A clearly demarcated permanent forest estate (PFE) is a critical component of an effective system of C&I. But in recent years the forest area of concessionaires has been eroding continually through illegal occupation, other unauthorized activities such as mining, and land claims by local communities under the "adat" or native customary land rights, as well as through government acquisitions.
- Too much, and overlapping, administrative intervention in FMUs by central and regional governments which has led to unnecessary costs and continuous interruptions to forest management units.
- The current ban on log exports is understandable when the country is working desperately to protect its dwindling forest resource. However, it has a significant downside too. Continuing prohibition could have major adverse economic impacts on the industry by limiting the ability of FMUs to benefit from the potential price premiums that could be gained from the export of lawfully produced/certified timber products. As a result, forest growers may not be able to be more efficient and competitive from possible increased access to European markets through the proposed voluntary partnership agreement, which is currently being negotiated.
- The project has basically involved two parties: the forest concessionaires responsible for the management of FMUs and the government working to ensure legality and sustainable management of the resource. As such the interactions relating to the project had been largely confined to these two groups. In spite of their growing importance in the sector the involvement of NGOs and the community appears to have been marginal.

The sustainability of the project results will depend on how well these negative elements are addressed.

4.3 Stakeholder involvement

The key stakeholder involved in the project right through all stages was the forest industry through the partnership of the Association of Forest Concessionaires (APHI). This was important since they were the major players in managing the wood resource. In addition some NGOs had also been associated with the project such as consultants representing the organization of foresters.

It appears that community and other key NGOs were not sufficiently involved in the project activities. It has been estimated that 50-60 million people, almost a quarter of the population, live in land classified as forest zone.¹ The project team explained, however, that the project was concerned with the weak capacity of FMU staff in monitoring the SFM process. The government also has a policy of accommodating human settlement in selected forestland. Increasing community involvement in forests is also evident from the fact that among the number of FMUs certified by LEI under its voluntary certification scheme in 2009 there were 12 community-managed forests compared with three industry FMUs. Community forests are involved in producing a complementary resource in addition to wood – non-timber forest products such as medicinal plants, food, rattan etc. As such, they play an important role in the management of forests. But unless their efforts are appropriately harnessed it could lead to unsustainable use of forests, which could undo efforts towards SFM. If the obligations imposed upon the FMUs were strictly followed it could help address these concerns to a certain extent.

The other related group, which does not seem to have played a significant role in the project, is the NGOs. In spite of assurances to the contrary, the ex-post evaluation consultant was unable to meet with any representatives from either of these group during the visit to the country. Willingness of NGOs to support SFM is evident in the Nature Conservancy's commitment to support IMPG training and possible WWF support for capacity building of FMUs in Central Kalimantan. There have also been other NGOs such as the Tropical Forest Foundation (TFF) that had carried out Reduced Impact Logging Training in several FMUs. Such

¹ See FAO, Country paper Asia Pacific Forestry Sector Outlook Study II, Indonesia Forestry Outlook Study, Bangkok 2009.

involvement undoubtedly, has been beneficial. If these stakeholders had been involved in the planning and implementation of the project it would have enhanced the credibility of the project.

4.4 The overall role and contribution of the project in light of sectoral policies, development programmes, priorities and requirements to improve the criteria and indicators of sustainable forest management (SFM).

The project PD389/05 has played a pivotal role in implementing government policy on SFM which takes a 'reward and punishment' approach. The ability of self-assessment for the issue of annual logging license has been a major boon to the industry that diligently applied IMPG. The fact that an independent third party assesses the FMU effort has also enhanced its attraction. These features have encouraged the industry to implement IMPG at the FMU level. The success of the project in promoting SFM has culminated in embedding the policy through Ministerial Regulation P38/2009 to cover all types of forests.

The new approach also appears to have received the endorsement of the international community, which has provided the industry with additional support to continue the training in IMPG. In addition, the ongoing negotiations with the European Union on market access also have provided further encouragement for the application of C&I. At the time of the ex-post evaluation WWF was working on a plan to support capacity building for SFM in eight concession areas in Central Borneo.

The training modules developed in consultation with stakeholders, and tested within a number of FMUs, have helped to show up the practical usefulness of C&I, as well as the need to adjust them to meet local needs. In the process the number of applicable indicators had been reduced to 43 following field tests carried out in 70 FMUs.

A significant adjustment to C&I promoted following the implementation of the project is to limit FMU reporting to silviculture-based indicators to the exclusion of macro level indicators such as biodiversity, water and soil protection, carbon absorption, which are difficult to measure at the FMU level. However, this seems a controversial move with some countries arguing that such exclusions reduce the role of C&I as a tool to promote SFM.

It also has suggested the need for different indicators in respect of mangroves as the current ITTO C&I do not capture the intricacies involved in managing them.

4.5 The current status of criteria and indicators (C&I) of SFM in Indonesia, the effectiveness of the project's implementation and its effectiveness in promoting SFM.

C&I are being implemented actively in Indonesia with the interest of the government and industry on a scale unseen before. The industry interest is stimulated by the 'carrot and stick' approach the government is taking to forest management of the FMUs. The incentive for those FMUs applying IPMG effectively to self-assess annual logging licenses based on an independent assessment seems to have captured the imagination of concessionaires.

Project 389/05 has played an important role in promoting C&I in Indonesia through well-designed course material to capture the ITTO C&I, special features of relevant FMUs in Indonesia as well as the additional focus on verification of legality. The training was also intensive and practical.

An independent assessor authorized by the accreditation body now performs the assessment of FMUs for issue of annual logging licenses. This was previously done by officials. This is a major move that has contributed to enhanced credibility of compulsory certification.

There is great enthusiasm among the FMUs for the MoF certification scheme because of the incentive it offers them for self-assessment of the annual logging plan. It saves the FMUs both time and money.

APHI has obtained international support for the effort with the Nature Conservancy funding further training for FMU staff.

However, only employees of 120 of the 323 concessions have so far undergone the training at the conclusion of the project. It is important to involve the rest as well as to ensure the management in all FMUs understand and adopt the systems within their administration.

But the role of the NGOs and the community in the management regime involving IMPG is not apparent. Although the project was intended to train FMU staff, it would have been helpful to involve the community in the training and implementation to improve effectiveness in promoting SFM using C&I .

There is a generally held view in the country that the scale of illegal logging has also declined in recent years. This development, if sustained, will help further in implementing measures towards SFM.

4.6 The contributions of the specific studies in various C&I-related tools/manuals/guidelines prepared by the project as regards the monitoring of sustainable forest management in the country.

There have been a number of important studies that had been undertaken as part of the project. They include:

- Among the other documents published as part of the project those that have made a significant contribution include:
 - Training modules painstakingly prepared incorporating ITTO C&I, domestic circumstances and requirements for timber legality verification.
- Report on Training on the application of Internal Monitoring Performance Guidelines (IMPG): Evaluation its impacts on sustainable management of Production Forest at Forest Management Unit Level (December 2008) and
- Final Report Analyzing Government Policies to Support Sustainable Forest Management (February 2009).

But the most important document emerged following the completion of the project. It was based largely on the successful outcome of the project in developing and promoting the IMPG. This was Regulation P.38/Menhut-II/2009 issued by the Minister of Forestry, which brought together in one place updated regulations on standards and guidelines relating to:

- a) Assessment of performance in SFM within state owned forests.
- b) Timber legality verification from state owned forests
- c) Verification of timber legality from state owned forests managed by the community
- d) Timber legality verification in primary industry and downstream timber industry
- e) Verification of timber legality from privately owned forests, and
- f) Verification of timber legality for timber utilization license holders.

These documents have contributed significantly to cementing the role of IMPG in promoting SFM in Indonesia.

4.7 The results and potential impact of applied research conducted by the project (if any) and its contribution to the overall knowledge on criteria and indicators of sustainable forest management in the country.

There were a number of areas where the work done on the project have contributed to expand the knowledge on criteria and indicators and contain wider significance for C&I overall. They relate in particular to:

- Development of training packages. This involved a) incorporating three elements – ITTO C&I, specific requirements of FMUs in the country, and means of verification of legality; and b) following the training with visits to trainees to ascertain how effectively they were applying the IMPG within their own domain. The results were used to revamp training to address the deficiencies.
- Identifying the need for different indicators on mangrove management compared with other types of forests. Since a number of countries utilize mangroves this may have implications beyond Indonesia.
- Recommendation based on ground experience, to exclude indicators beyond the control of management units (such as demarcating boundaries) from the responsibility of the FMU is practical from the FMU viewpoint but raises important issues relating to fundamentals of C&I. But if all elements beyond the control of FMUs are excluded that could undermine the purpose of

using this tool to promote SFM. Considering their wider implications common grounds need to be sought through further reflection.

- Incorporation of verification of legality to the training on C&I. This has assumed new significance with key western countries focusing on eliminating illegal timber imports into their markets.

4.8 The impact of project activities on the improvements of forest management monitoring.

Project activities have had a major impact on forest management monitoring in Indonesia on account of the training offered as well as the associated action taken by the government. These actions included a move away from pure regulatory measures, to implementing a combination of market approach mixed with regulatory actions, to apply C&I. The ability of FMUs that effectively implemented IMPG to gain self-assessment of the issuing of annual logging licenses is one such example. The government enacted the new approach into law through the issue of ministerial regulation 38/2009.

The new approach captured the imagination of the industry, and as a result, the numbers seeking IMPG training exceeded the planned capacity to provide the teaching. When the project facility eventually ran out the APHI obtained the support of an NGO – the Nature Conservancy, to fund additional training. The amount of funding was not large but its significance was in the industry being driven by the need for training.

It also got the endorsement of the international community as evident from the Nature Conservancy support for training as well as the interest of the WWF to support capacity building in a number of FMUs, as well as of the European Union to negotiate with the government for access to its market.

One crucial element of forest management monitoring was the establishment of the electronic database to allow FMUs to record implementation of IMPG. This will eventually provide the MoF with a macro level picture of implementing SFM in the country. But this had not been completed by the time the project was completed. The project coordinator advised that this has been done since completion of the project.

However, a number of additional steps need to be taken to ensure the full impact of the initiatives. One of these is to expand the training to encompass all FMUs. In addition it is essential to gain the commitment of concession managers to the move. Another important area is to involve forest communities since they play a key role in determining how the resource is utilized. An enhanced role for the NGOs is also essential.

4.9 The effectiveness of dissemination of project results.

All documents except the Guidelines for Internal Monitoring of SFM Performance have been distributed to FMUs as appropriate at the time the project concluded in April 2009. Since the use of most of the documentation required trained staff it is logical that distribution was made through the trainees. Nevertheless, the documents have been posted on the MoF website.

The project completion report, which contained detailed information on its achievements, has been widely distributed including in the Ministry website.

However, the most effective potential means of disseminating the information was through the involvement of a) all FMUs as well as b) the management of FMUs in the actual training. This has not happened yet since only technical staff from 30 per cent of FMUs has so far been trained.

The project document noted the NGOs as a target beneficiary of the project but failed to note the community as such. Neither of these groups was selected to receive project results. This was a major drawback in the dissemination of project results.

4.10 The overall post-project situation in Indonesia.

There is an air of confidence among the major players in the sustainable management of the forestry sector following a range of measures taken recently all revolving around the results of the current project. The training in the application of internal monitoring of performance guidelines and the associated audit system, as well as verification of legality initiated through project PD 389/05 Rev.2 (F) have all been well received by the forest industry.

The involvement of the industry from the beginning, and offer of incentives for application of IMPG, have helped to ensure their adoption. The government has followed that up by issuing Regulation P38/2009, which has provided the necessary legal recognition of the tools in the promotion of SFM by all segments of the forestry sector in Indonesia. The endorsement by the international community as evident from the advanced stage of negotiations between Indonesia and the EU to conclude a Voluntary Partnership Agreement under the framework of the EU FLEGT, and NGO offer of support to help capacity building of FMUs have added further credence.

Nevertheless, the project does not seem to have achieved the entire post-project situation envisaged in the project proposal. According to that the following results were expected after project completion:

- a) Forest management units have capability in applying the monitoring SFM performance system to evaluate the current management performance and action plan for a continuous performance improvement
- b) Framework of database system is prepared
- c) System database has been implemented and designed to accommodate the report from forest management units
- d) Clear view on the future forest management development, goals and enabling conditions required
- e) Enhanced the effectiveness of sustainable forest management policy
- f) General results of forest management units after project completion is that all relevant parties (government and forest management units) engage the same view of future forest management development, and apply the same system of monitoring of SFM performance on the basis of the criteria and indicators for SFM.
- g) Strong communication and data flow between government and private sector will be established.

It does not appear that a number of these have been achieved:

With regard to a) currently only 120 out of the 323 FMUs, have any staff trained in the application of IMPG and auditing to all FMUs. But the APHI is continuing with the training programme with some overseas assistance. Training all FMUs, relevant government officials as well as the auditors is critically important for the success of the C&I system.

Regarding b) and c), the databases referred to have not been completed so far. But training was going on at the time of the ex-post evaluation.

In general aims d) to f) have been achieved but there is a continuing need to ensure FMU managers have a commitment to C&I for SFM.

Achieving g) is being held up by the delay in establishing the database to accommodate FMU reporting.

In addition, some obstacles to efficient management of FMUs remain. They include: uncertainty of concession boundaries as a result of illegal occupations and unauthorized use, government acquisitions, land claims by local communities etc which have tended to erode the land base of FMUs. There is also too much overlapping interference in concessions by central and regional governments.

Communities have an important role to play in sustainable forest management. An estimated one quarter of the population live in the mostly rural, state-claimed "forest zone"² of Indonesia. The growing importance of community forests is also evident in the fact that in 2009, 12 community FMUs had gained LEI certification compared with only five industry FMUs. As such their impact on forests is significant and cannot be ignored in measures towards SFM. They need to be closely involved in projects of this nature, from the designing stage to implementation. Similar involvement of NGOs is also necessary.

² See FAO, 2009.

4.11 Unexpected effects and impacts, either harmful or beneficial, and the reasons for their occurrences.

Among the unexpected effects were two that caused immediate concern. One was the realization that two of the sites where the training were to take place to be unsuitable for field work, and the other, to find at the same time more than the number planned for training wanting to get on the courses. The problems have been solved by intensifying the training at the other eight venues selected, and by extending the project by four months all of which had been accomplished at no additional cost to the project.

The keen interest from FMUs for training bodes well for implementing C&I. This was largely on account of the incentives offered to allow self-assessment of logging plans.

When the project was approved by the ITTC there has been an expectation that local communities and NGOs were also to be involved closely in project planning and implementation as the project proposal indicated. However, in the event this had not been fully realized.

Another positive unforeseen development has been the interest the project, and its follow up, have attracted from overseas. INGOs and foreign governments have seen these as positive developments reflecting the government's commitment to SFM and have come forward to support them (e.g. Nature Conservancy funding for IMPG training, Norway's proposal for funding related to REDD).

There is a commonly held view that illegal logging has declined in the recent past. Some adduce this to the measures taken surrounding sustainable forest management, in particular the recognition of government's efforts to promote verification of legality of timber.

4.12 The cost efficiency in the implementation of the project, including the technical, financial and managerial aspects.

The project has been well managed and commitments delivered within budget. The consultants examined the steering committee reports and audit reports of the project and found it had been completed within the financial and other parameters.

One change from the original plan was the reduction in the number of training centres from ten to eight. This was due to the late recognition that two of the selected sites were unsuitable for fieldwork. But the change has not led to additional costs to the budget or caused any delays to implementation of the planned training.

The four-month delay in completing the project has been caused by the inability to complete the training due to intervention of end of year holidays and the higher than expected demand for training. The change has been accommodated within budget.

In terms of technical aspects the project has produced some useful reports. They included Training modules prepared incorporating ITTO C&I, domestic circumstances and requirements for timber legality verification. The training packages had been field-tested prior to the commencement of the sessions. Additionally a training follow up report - Report on Training on the application of Internal Monitoring Performance Guidelines (IMPG): Evaluation its impacts on sustainable management of Production Forest at Forest Management Unit Level (December 2008) - assessed how effectively the trained were implementing the IMPG. All these had helped the development of a robust training programme which was an outstanding feature of the management of the project.

One area where the project management was found to be wanting was in respect of community and NGO involvement in planning and implementation as well as in the dissemination of project results.

4.13 Follow-up actions in order to enhance uptake of project results.

The role of forests in mitigating impacts of climate change is becoming increasingly recognised. Its significance for Indonesia is prominently featured, for example, in the letter of intent and the current negotiations with Norway on cooperation on REDD. But so far the role of forests in climate change has not been brought directly into the picture on SFM except to the extent of quantifying carbon levels. It is important to ensure the SFM and REDD and other climate related elements are addressed together so that all future

benefits related to climate change, as well as gains from SFM are duly recognised as part of the value of forests. One of the issues that needed to be addressed in this regard is combining the two permits IUPJL for REDD and IUPHHK for utilization of wood in natural production forest. There will be other aspects too. A comprehensive study of issues will be a useful first step.

Assurance of clear boundaries of FMU is critically important for the effective and efficient operation of FMUs. But in recent years the forest area of concessionaires has been declining gradually through illegal occupation, other unauthorized activities such as mining as well as through government acquisitions and land claims by local communities. Clearly demarcated boundaries of the permanent forest estate are an all important indicator of sustainability in ITTO C&I. In Indonesia too 'Area Certainty for License Holder' is a fundamental prerequisite under the Standards and Guidelines in Assessing Performance in SFM in the MoF regulations. Addressing this should be a high priority.

So far only 120 of the 323 concessionaires have sent their staff for training in IMPG. Even among those with trained staff, an ex-post evaluation of training undertaken by the project found that out of the 19 FMUs examined only 7 have been applying IMPG. So there is a fair way to go before all FMUs are equipped with the new tools and ready to implement action towards sustainability.

Another issue that needs to be addressed for the greater effectiveness of implementing IMPG is to eliminate overlapping interventions in FMUs by the central and regional governments. One study refers to visits to FMUs from officials on average 24 times a year involving 140 visit days (Final Report p21). This would be in addition to other forms of intervention. Such intrusions are counterproductive and can take a heavy toll on the efficiency of FMUs. Better coordination between central and local government bodies as well as intervention remotely through electronic means are among the possible options to address the issue.

Community involvement in forest management is rapidly expanding in Indonesia. For instance, in 2009 LEI had certified 12 community forests compared with just three industry FMUs. This trend is likely to continue and due recognition needs to be taken of the growing role of the community in promoting SFM and involve them in planning and implementation of projects of this nature.

Community involvement may also need to be brought into to play a greater role in the C&I as suggested in the Final Report on Developing Government Policy. For instance communities living adjacent to forests need to be given the opportunity to benefit from employment and business opportunities of the FMU. This could also be one effective way to curb the recurring illegal activities and unauthorized occupation of FMUs.

The other group that needs to be involved more closely in promoting C&I for SFM is NGOs. The Report on the Evaluation of impact of training in IMPG noted "in general MUs feel their relationship with NGOs is in disharmony". The report underlined the importance of greater cooperation to harness NGO energy to support SFM.

The project completion report concluded, "many key problems in achieving SFM were beyond the control of Management Units, e.g. legal assurance of working area and boundary marking; and social problems like illegal logging and shifting cultivation. Therefore, verifiers of the indicators of the aforementioned issues are best confined only to measuring performance whose achievement process is under the control of MUs. In this manner, MUs are not burdened with performance issues that beyond their control". This is a controversial matter. There are a number of key variables in assessing SFM which are beyond the control of FMUs and their exclusion could negate the purpose of C&I, namely to assess sustainable management. This is an issue of great significance to members and the ITTO needs to clarify how members should address it.

The research undertaken by the project has shown that the currently available indicators do not adequately capture the management of mangroves and they need to be developed.

To gain maximum benefit from applying IMPG a number of other stakeholders need to be trained in their use. They include all agencies that are involved in implementing the IMPG (e.g. central and regional government officials, audit agencies, certifying groups etc). It also needs the endorsement managers of FMUs.

4.14 The project's relative success or failure, including a summary of the key lessons learnt; and the identification of any issues or problems that should be taken into account in designing and implementing similar projects in the future.

The project has been of great significance to Indonesia not only for providing appropriate tools to implement SFM at the national and the FMU levels but also for playing a catalytic role in generating enthusiasm within the forest industry, and keen interest from the government to use it to ensure legality and sustainability of the forest resource including independent auditing of performance. The move has also received the endorsement of the international community, which has come forward to provide support.

Among the lessons learned is the reason for success of this initiative compared with earlier efforts to implement SFM. As always, appropriate timing is important: but apart from that the main success factors are:

- a. Incorporation of incentives for implementing C&I,
- b. Use of independent auditors to assess performance,
- c. Commitment of the APHI.

These elements have added credibility to the new C&I package, which has attracted interest of the industry, as well as donor countries.

Also among the lessons learned is the need for an 'appropriate environment' for the measures to succeed. In the long term the ban on log exports could remain a disincentive for FMUs to seek adoption of measures towards SFM. This is because the benefit of the effort, which is obviously to gain better prices for logs, may not come to them because they have to continue to sell the logs in the captive domestic market.

In relation to the appropriate environment a key requirement for the success of the initiative is the commitment of managers of FMUs. The training of technical people alone may not result in FMUs applying the tools unless the top management is committed to its aims. It is critically important that their assurance is gained prior to launching projects of this nature.

Also among the lessons learned is the need to involve all key stakeholders in designing and implementing C&I. In this regard the community, which is playing an increasing role in forest utilization, appears to be not directly included in decision-making or implementing C&I. They are significant users of the forest and living adjacent to the forests and can provide protection from fire and illegal utilization. A feeling of ownership would be beneficial in this regard.

Another group that needs to be closely involved are NGOs. Among other things, their involvement adds credibility to actions taken relating to SFM.

5 Conclusions and recommendations

5.1 Conclusions

The main conclusions that flow from the ex-post evaluation of project PD389/05 Rev.2 (F) are:

- i. A major factor that contributed to the success of the project was the involvement of forest concessionaires as partners through the APHI. As a result the industry felt an ownership of the initiative compared with most previous attempts, which were perceived as state driven.
- ii. Another important element of the project that led to its attraction to the industry and contributed to its success, was the government moving away from a purely regulatory approach to one that combined regulation with market orientation. For instance allowing the FMUs that successfully adopted IMPG to self-assess the issuing of annual logging license.
- iii. The training package developed for the project was both innovative and effective: innovative since it captured in one package the ITTO C&I, adaptation to the specific conditions of Indonesian FMUs and incorporating a new element, verification of legality. It was also effective since it was developed jointly with the industry, field-tested before launching and was retested following actual application by the alumni. All these contributed to the success of the training.

- iv. The IMPG training, as well as the follow up government regulations, have been received favourably not only by the domestic industry but also by the international donor community. This is evident from the continued funding of training for IMPG by the Nature Conservancy, new interest in supporting capacity building of FMUs in Central Kalimantan by WWF, and ongoing negotiations with the European Union to promote market access for Indonesian forest products. Verification of legality requirements also meets the requirements of the Lacey Act, which could help entry to the US market.
- v. The project also has worked to utilize modern technology to assist with reporting on C&I, such as by linking with GIS data, setting up a database with MoF for FMUs to report on progress in implementing IMPG on line. This bodes well for the efficiency of future such projects. However, these had not been finalized at the time of project conclusion.
- vi. The project planning and implementation appears to virtually exclude forest dependent communities. This is unfortunate since community involvement in Indonesian forests is continually expanding and they could play a decisive role in SFM. Also excluded from any major role were NGOs. The absence of these two groups has tended to devalue the outputs of the project and limit its impact on SFM.
- vii. At the time of project conclusion only about 30 per cent of the FMUs had taken advantage of the training. Fortunately the APHI had obtained marginal additional funding from donors to continue the programme. The APHI, with any possible assistance from government and donors, need to continue the programme.
- viii. Two issues relating to indicators emerged from the research undertaken within the project. They were a) the need for new indicators to assess mangroves and b) the suggestion that FMUs should be exempt from the responsibility to provide information relating to macro level indicators such as biodiversity, security of forest area, water and soil, carbon absorption and REDD. The latter is controversial and needs to be considered carefully before implementing.
- ix. A factor that has a major bearing on the efficiency of FMUs is the absence of a clearly defined permanent forest estate (PFE). With greater regional autonomy granted to provinces in recent years, with growing areas of forestland being allocated to human settlement, and with frequent illegal occupation, FMUs have not been able to have assurance of their boundaries. PFE is an essential element of C&I. Lack of it can have a serious impact on the efficiency of an FMU and seriously impact on SFM.
- x. The role of forests in climate change mitigation continues to assume growing importance worldwide. It has a major impact on SFM. Yet the current C&I do not accommodate the capture of detailed aspects relating to emerging climate related issues such as REDD. This issue needs to be addressed without delay.
- xi. The full realization of the benefit of the application of IMPG and the associated regulatory regime as well as the benefits of potential greater access to the European market depend on how the market signals are transmitted to forest concessionaires. A major obstacle to this process is the existing ban on log exports, which compels them to sell to the local industry. The issue needs reconsideration.

5.2 Recommendations

5.2.1 Recommendations to ITTO

- a) Develop new indicators to measure progress in relation to mangroves since the current indicators do not properly address their specific circumstances;
- b) Project Completion report recommended that FMUs should be exempt from the responsibility to provide information on indicators over which they had little control. They include macro level indicators such as boundaries of FMU, water and soil, biodiversity, climate change related issues such as REDD. Such exclusions can have a major impact on the credibility of C&I and needs to be addressed by ITTO for the benefit of all members.
- c) The role of forests in climate change mitigation continues to assume growing importance worldwide. It has a major impact on SFM. The current C&I set does not fully capture the elements involved and may need to be revised.

5.2.2 Recommendation to Indonesian government

- d) At the time of project conclusion only about 30 per cent of the FMUs had benefited from the training. The government needs to assist the industry to find resources to complete the training to cover all FMUs.
- e) A factor that has a major bearing on the efficiency of FMUs is the absence of a clearly defined permanent forest estate (PFE). It is the responsibility of the government to ensure a legally defined PFE, which is a key to the efficiency of FMUs and a foundation of C&I.
- f) A major obstacle to the FMUs benefiting from market opportunities arising from the use of IMPG and other related government measures is the existing ban on log exports, which compels them to sell to the local industry. It would be desirable to review this decision.
- g) The project planning and implementation appears to virtually exclude communities. This is unfortunate since community involvement in Indonesian forests is continually expanding and they could play a decisive role in SFM. Also excluded from any major role were NGOs. The absence of these two groups has tended to devalue the outputs of the project and limit its impact on SFM. Action is necessary to ensure this situation is corrected for this project and all similar projects of the future.
- h) There is an urgent need to develop better understanding and coordination between the authorities of the central and local governments to avoid overlapping and excessive interventions in FMUs.
- i) As recommended by the training review assessment, it is important that the government develop mechanisms to resolve land disputes with local communities so that forest concession will be free from tenure problems.

5.2.3 Recommendations to APHI

- j) At the conclusion of the project less than a third of the FMUs had been involved in the IMPG training. This is grossly inadequate to promote SFM of the concessionaires. Every effort should be made to expand coverage to all FMUs.
- k) Given the advantages IMPG offers, APHI may show its commitment by encouraging FMUs to give high priority to training and raise funds for the purpose as well urge all members to apply them.
- l) It is the confirmed view of the training alumni that progress in implementing IMPG at FMU level depends on the level of commitment of managers. It is essential that this assurance be obtained if the effort is to succeed.
- m) Community and NGOs can play a very useful role in promoting SFM and assisting FMUs in their efforts to gain efficiency. Efforts should be made to find ways to muster their energies positively.

6. Acknowledgements

Ex-post evaluation team wishes to thank Director Listya Kusumawardhani, Lasmini, Project Coordinator, Irebella Siswando, Laksmi Banowati, Dodi Andriadi and several other officials of the Ministry of Forestry, Asmui of Burung Indonesia, Alan Purbawiyatna of the Indonesian Ecolabelling Institute, Director of the Forestry Training Institute Bogor and his staff, Nanang Roffandi Ahmad, Executive Director and Lisman of the Association of Indonesian Forest Concessionaires (APHI), Fairus Mulya, Director Bina Ovivipari Semesta and his staff, and many others who assisted consultant Don Wijewardana with information and frank and open discussion during his visit to Indonesia.

The team also wishes to express its gratitude to the Executive Director of ITTO Mr Emmanuel Ze Meka, and the staff - Dr Ma, Mr Mansur and Ms Yang, for the opportunity to undertake the consultancy and the support extended to us.

7. ANNEXES

Annex 1

COUNTRY DATA INDONESIA

Area (1,000 ha)		181,157
Population (1,000)		228,864
Per Capita GDP (USD) :		3,454
Estimated total forest area (m ha)		105-120
PFE (1,000 ha)	Natural closed forest	100,382
	Natural	46,000
	Planted	2,500
	Production	
	Protection :	22,500
	Area/1,000 People :	387
	Annual change rate (%) :	-2.0
Production (1,000 m ³)	Woodfuel :	70,719
	Industrial roundwood :	28,099
Import (1,000 m ³)	Industrial roundwood :	120
	Sawntimber :	311
Export (1,000 m ³)		

	Industrial roundwood :	685
	Sawntimber :	1,853
Employment in forestry sector (1,000)		321
% contribution to GDP :		2.5

Sources: FAO (2009) State of the World's Forests 2009 ITTO (2006) Status of Tropical Forest Management 2005

Annexe 2

EXPOST EVALUATION OF PROJECT PD390/5 Rev 1: INDONESIA

CONSULTANT'S MEETINGS AND VISITS

DATE	TIME	DETAILS OF ENGAGEMENT	VENUE
05 July 2010	0800	Meeting with Listya Kusumawardhani, Director Natural Production Forest Development. Also present Irebella Siswondo, and Lisman (APHI)	Manggala Wanabhakti bldg. Jakarta (MW)
	0915	Meeting with Nanang Roffandi Ahmad, Executive Director Association of Indonesian Forest Concessionaires. Also present Irebella Siswondo and Lisman.	MW
	1030	Meeting with Laksmi Banowati, Deputy Director of Technical Cooperation. Also participating Teguh Rahardja, Deputy Director for Multilateral Affairs, (Irebella Siswondo and others.	MW
	1145	Meeting with Muhammad Kuswanda, consultant on Project 389/05	MW
	1400	Checking documents relating to the project 389/05 with Irebella Siswondo	MW
06 July 2010	1030	Meeting with Helmi Basalamah, Director Centre for Forestry Education and Training and Udy Tyastoto, Head of programme and Evaluation, Arifah Prihartini, Training Facilitator and Depi Susilawati, Training Facilitator. Also present Irebella Siswondo and Asmui, Data Analysis and Policy Assistant to the Project	Bogor
	1400	Meeting with Alan Purbawiyatna, Programme Director, Indonesian Ecolabelling Institute. Also present Irebella Siswondo and Asmui, Data Analysis and Policy Assistant to the Project.	Taman Bogor Baru, Bogor

07 July 2010	1000	Meeting of officials and stakeholders involved in the project attended by: Magdalena (Sect. DG BPK), Wawan Kurniawan (KLN Centre for International Cooperation), Lasmini (Project coordinator), Purwoto (Centre for Standardisation and Environment), Eleonora (BPHA), Laksmi Banowati (Deputy Director of Technical Cooperation), Listya Kusumawardhani, (Director Natural Production Forest Development), Chairman.	MW
	1400	Meeting with Project coordinator Lasmini	MW

08 JULY 10	0400	Travel to Pontianak, and then drive up to Bunbun river for a 3 hour boat ride to reach Bina Ovivipari Semesta FMU at Tansijung Hararan village. Met at the airport by Director Fairus Mulia, who went with us to the mangrove management site and arboretum. Meeting on site with other staff including general manager Teng Surya Sarijaya. Also participating Lisman (APHI) and Lasmini (Project Coordinator). Return to Pontianak by evening.	Bina Ovivipari Semesta FMU at Tansijung Hararan village
09 July 2010	1000	Meeting with other key staff of Agency for Monitoring and Controlling Production Forest utilization at their office at Pontianak including Wahyu Wardoyo, Head of Agency for Production forest and harvesting/utilisation, and Aris R Sumule, Head of Division for Monitoring and evaluation of production forest in W.Kalimantan. Also present Lisman (APHI) and Lasmini (Project coordinator). Back in Jakarta 2215.	BP2HP Office, Jl Sui Raya Dalam, Pontianak.
10 July 2010		Weekend. Going through notes, writing up reports of meetings etc	Hotel
11 July 2010		Weekend. Going through notes, connecting dots.	Hotel
12 July 2010		Following up on meetings with Lisman, Asmui, Bella and Lasmini on outstanding commitments and collecting data from different sources.	MW
13 July 2010	1000 PM	Meeting with Lasmini, Bella and Dodi Collecting information gathered from different sources.	MW
14 July 2010		Calls on different officials, emails and telephone contacts for information to tie up still outstanding loose ends.	MW

15 July 2010	All day	Formulating preliminary conclusions and transmitting to Lasmini.	Hotel
16 July 2010	1030 1400	Exit meeting chaired by Ibu Listya and attended by Lasmini, Bella, Asmui, Laksmi Banowati, Deputy Director of Technical Cooperation, (other names to be confirmed by LAsmini. Winding down on Indonesia and preparing for the Philippines visit	MW Hotel
17 July 2010	0630	Leave Jakarta for Manila	